

Phase-space and Optimal Transport formulation of the Einstein equations in vacuum

Yann Brenier, CNRS,
LMO, Orsay, Université Paris-Saclay
(just moving from DMA-ENS Paris)

Webinar Kinetic and Fluid equations, 17 Dec 2021
French-Korean IRL in Mathematics

General Relativity (in vacuum)

'Free fall' follows geodesic curves $s \in \mathbb{R} \rightarrow x(s) \in \mathbb{R}^4$

i.e. critical points of $\int g_{ij}(x(s)) \frac{dx^i(s)}{ds} \frac{dx^j(s)}{ds} ds$

where g is a Lorentzian metric over \mathbb{R}^4 ,

General Relativity (in vacuum)

'Free fall' follows geodesic curves $s \in \mathbb{R} \rightarrow x(s) \in \mathbb{R}^4$

i.e. critical points of $\int g_{ij}(x(s)) \frac{dx^i(s)}{ds} \frac{dx^j(s)}{ds} ds$

where g is a Lorentzian metric over \mathbb{R}^4 , which reads

$$\frac{dx^i(s)}{ds} = \xi^i(s), \quad \frac{d\xi^i(s)}{ds} = -\Gamma_{jk}^i(x(s)) \xi^j(s) \xi^k(s),$$

$$2g_{mi}\Gamma_{jk}^i + \partial_m g_{jk} - \partial_j g_{mk} - \partial_k g_{mj} = 0.$$

General Relativity (in vacuum)

'Free fall' follows geodesic curves $s \in \mathbb{R} \rightarrow x(s) \in \mathbb{R}^4$

i.e. critical points of $\int g_{ij}(x(s)) \frac{dx^i(s)}{ds} \frac{dx^j(s)}{ds} ds$

where g is a Lorentzian metric over \mathbb{R}^4 , which reads

$$\frac{dx^i(s)}{ds} = \xi^i(s), \quad \frac{d\xi^i(s)}{ds} = -\Gamma_{jk}^i(x(s)) \xi^j(s) \xi^k(s),$$

$$2g_{mi}\Gamma_{jk}^i + \partial_m g_{jk} - \partial_j g_{mk} - \partial_k g_{mj} = 0.$$

Einstein equations in vacuum
just means that g has zero Ricci curvature.

Phase-space formulation of the Ricci curvature

Key idea: view Γ as a collection of 4 vector fields over the phase space $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ which are linear in ξ :

$$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x)\xi^\gamma,$$

Phase-space formulation of the Ricci curvature

Key idea: view Γ as a collection of 4 vector fields over the phase space $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ which are linear in ξ :

$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x)\xi^\gamma$, so that the Riemann and the Ricci curvatures just read as commutators:

$$R_{jkm}^n(x)\xi^m = \left((\partial_{x^k} + V_k^\gamma \partial_{\xi^\gamma}) V_j^n - (\partial_{x^j} + V_j^\gamma \partial_{\xi^\gamma}) V_k^n \right) (x, \xi)$$

Phase-space formulation of the Ricci curvature

Key idea: view Γ as a collection of 4 vector fields over the phase space $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ which are linear in ξ :

$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x)\xi^\gamma$, so that the Riemann and the Ricci curvatures just read as commutators:

$$\begin{aligned} R_{jkm}^n(x)\xi^m &= \left((\partial_{x^k} + V_k^\gamma \partial_{\xi^\gamma}) V_j^n - (\partial_{x^j} + V_j^\gamma \partial_{\xi^\gamma}) V_k^n \right) (x, \xi) \\ &= \partial_{x^k} V_j^n + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^n) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^n - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_i^\gamma V_\gamma^n), \end{aligned}$$

Phase-space formulation of the Ricci curvature

Key idea: view Γ as a collection of 4 vector fields over the phase space $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ which are linear in ξ :

$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x)\xi^\gamma$, so that the Riemann and the Ricci curvatures just read as commutators:

$$R_{jkm}^n(x)\xi^m = \left((\partial_{x^k} + V_k^\gamma \partial_{\xi^\gamma}) V_j^n - (\partial_{x^j} + V_j^\gamma \partial_{\xi^\gamma}) V_k^n \right) (x, \xi)$$

$$= \partial_{x^k} V_j^n + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^n) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^n - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_i^\gamma V_\gamma^n),$$

$$R_{km}(x)\xi^m = \partial_{x^k} V_j^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^j) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^j - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_j^\gamma V_\gamma^j).$$

The main result

Theorem: Let (g, Γ) be a smooth solution to the Einstein equations in vacuum. Let us define

$$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x) \xi^\gamma, \quad (x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8,$$

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) = \partial_{\xi^k} A^j(x, \xi) - \partial_{\xi^q} A^q(x, \xi) \delta_k^j,$$

$$A^j(x, \xi) = \xi^j \det g(x) \cos\left(\frac{g_{\alpha\beta}(x) \xi^\alpha \xi^\beta}{2}\right).$$

The main result

Theorem: Let (g, Γ) be a smooth solution to the Einstein equations in vacuum. Let us define

$$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x) \xi^\gamma, \quad (x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8,$$

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) = \partial_{\xi^k} A^j(x, \xi) - \partial_{\xi^q} A^q(x, \xi) \delta_k^j,$$

$$A^j(x, \xi) = \xi^j \det g(x) \cos\left(\frac{g_{\alpha\beta}(x) \xi^\alpha \xi^\beta}{2}\right).$$

Then (C, V) is a solution of the following generalized matrix-valued optimal transport problem:

Find a pair $(C, V)(x, \xi)$ of 4×4 matrix-valued fields over the 'phase-space' $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ critical point of

$$\int \text{trace}(C(x, \xi) V^2(x, \xi)) dx d\xi$$

Find a pair $(C, V)(x, \xi)$ of 4×4 matrix-valued fields over the 'phase-space' $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ critical point of

$$\int \text{trace}(C(x, \xi) V^2(x, \xi)) dx d\xi$$

subject to the 'generalized continuity equation'

$$\partial_{x^j} C_k^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (CV + VC)_k^j = 0$$

Find a pair $(C, V)(x, \xi)$ of 4×4 matrix-valued fields over the 'phase-space' $(x, \xi) \in \mathbb{R}^8$ critical point of

$$\int \text{trace}(C(x, \xi) V^2(x, \xi)) dx d\xi$$

subject to the 'generalized continuity equation'

$$\partial_{x^j} C_k^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (CV + VC)_k^j = 0$$

and the linear symmetry constraints $\partial_{\xi^i} V_j^k = \partial_{\xi^j} V_i^k$,

$$\partial_{\xi^m} C_\gamma^\gamma \delta_k^j - 3\partial_{\xi^m} C_k^j = \partial_{\xi^k} C_\gamma^\gamma \delta_m^j - 3\partial_{\xi^k} C_m^j.$$

ref: <https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-03311171>

Relation with the (quadratic) Monge OT problem

$$\text{Monge}_2(\rho_0, \rho_1)^2 = \inf \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} |T(x) - x|^2 \rho_0(x) dx,$$

for all Borel maps T for which $\rho_1(y)dy$ is the image by $y = T(x)$ of $\rho_0(x)dx$.

Relation with the (quadratic) Monge OT problem

$$\text{Monge}_2(\rho_0, \rho_1)^2 = \inf \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} |T(x) - x|^2 \rho_0(x) dx,$$

for all Borel maps T for which $\rho_1(y)dy$ is the image by $y = T(x)$ of $\rho_0(x)dx$.

Then, one can show:

$$\text{Monge}_2(\rho_0, \rho_1)^2 = \inf \int_0^1 dt \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} \rho(t, x) |v(t, x)|^2 dx,$$

where (ρ, v) is subject to $\partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho v) = 0$, $\rho(0, \cdot) = \rho_0$, $\rho(1, \cdot) = \rho_1$.

(Benamou-B. 2000, see also Otto 2001, Ambrosio-Gigli-Savaré 2005.)

Relation with the (quadratic) Monge OT problem

$$\text{Monge}_2(\rho_0, \rho_1)^2 = \inf \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} |T(x) - x|^2 \rho_0(x) dx,$$

for all Borel maps T for which $\rho_1(y)dy$ is the image by $y = T(x)$ of $\rho_0(x)dx$.

Then, one can show:

$$\text{Monge}_2(\rho_0, \rho_1)^2 = \inf \int_0^1 dt \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} \rho(t, x) |v(t, x)|^2 dx,$$

where (ρ, v) is subject to $\partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho v) = 0$, $\rho(0, \cdot) = \rho_0$, $\rho(1, \cdot) = \rho_1$.

(Benamou-B. 2000, see also Otto 2001, Ambrosio-Gigli-Savaré 2005.)

N.B. Optimality equations read: $v = \nabla \phi$, $\partial_t v + \nabla \cdot (|v|^2/2) = 0$.

General Relativity GR and Optimal Transport OT

Recent works linking GR and OT:

A. Mondino, S. Suhr arXiv:1810.13309, 2018,

R. McCann, Camb. J. Math. 2020, based on
Lott-Sturm-Villani OT definition of Ricci curvature.

General Relativity GR and Optimal Transport OT

Recent works linking GR and OT:

A. Mondino, S. Suhr arXiv:1810.13309, 2018,

R. McCann, Camb. J. Math. 2020, based on
Lott-Sturm-Villani OT definition of Ricci curvature.

Our approach is different and related to the
hydrodynamical formulation of OT (Benamou-B. 2000).

ref: Y.B. CRAS 2021 (<https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-03311171>).

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (1/4)

$$\partial_t \phi + \frac{1}{2} |\nabla \phi|^2 = 0, \quad \phi = \phi(t, \mathbf{x}), \quad \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{T}^d,$$

written as a 'conservation law' for $V = \nabla \phi$,

$$\partial_t V + \nabla \left(\frac{|V|^2}{2} \right) = 0, \quad V = V(t, \mathbf{x}) \in \mathbb{R}^d, \quad \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{T}^d.$$

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (1/4)

$$\partial_t \phi + \frac{1}{2} |\nabla \phi|^2 = 0, \quad \phi = \phi(t, \mathbf{x}), \quad \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{T}^d,$$

written as a 'conservation law' for $V = \nabla \phi$,

$$\partial_t V + \nabla \left(\frac{|V|^2}{2} \right) = 0, \quad V = V(t, \mathbf{x}) \in \mathbb{R}^d, \quad \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{T}^d.$$

Ignoring BC, let us look for critical points (A, V) of

$$\int \left(-\partial_t A \cdot V - \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} \right) dx dt, \quad A = A(t, \mathbf{x}) \in \mathbb{R}^d.$$

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (2/4)

Critical points (A, V) of

$$\mathcal{I}(A, V) = \int \left(-\partial_t A \cdot V - \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} \right) dx dt.$$

$$\partial_A \mathcal{I}(A, V) = 0 \Rightarrow (1) \quad \partial_t V + \nabla \left(\frac{|V|^2}{2} \right) = 0$$

(as expected),

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (2/4)

Critical points (A, V) of

$$\mathcal{I}(A, V) = \int \left(-\partial_t A \cdot V - \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} \right) dx dt.$$

$$\partial_A \mathcal{I}(A, V) = 0 \Rightarrow (1) \quad \partial_t V + \nabla \left(\frac{|V|^2}{2} \right) = 0$$

(as expected),

$$\partial_V \mathcal{I}(A, V) = 0 \Rightarrow (2) \quad \partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$$

(additional information that we are now going to use).

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3/4)

We use (2) $\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ to rewrite $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$ as:

$$\mathcal{I}_2(A, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} dx dt.$$

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3/4)

We use (2) $\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ to rewrite $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$ as:

$$\mathcal{I}_2(A, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} dx dt.$$

Claim: whenever (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, then (A, V) is also critical for $\mathcal{I}_2(A, V)$, but subject to (2).

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3/4)

We use (2) $\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ to rewrite $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$ as:

$$\mathcal{I}_2(A, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} dx dt.$$

Claim: whenever (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, then (A, V) is also critical for $\mathcal{I}_2(A, V)$, but subject to (2).

Proof: Let us introduce Lagrangian $\mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = \mathcal{I}_2(A, V) - \int B \cdot (\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A))$.

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3/4)

We use (2) $\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ to rewrite $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$ as:

$$\mathcal{I}_2(A, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot A)|V|^2}{2} dxdt.$$

Claim: whenever (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, then (A, V) is also critical for $\mathcal{I}_2(A, V)$, but subject to (2).

Proof: Let us introduce Lagrangian $\mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = \mathcal{I}_2(A, V) - \int B \cdot (\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A))$.

The corresponding optimality equations read:

$$\partial_B \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow (2) \text{ (of course)}, \quad \partial_V \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow (\nabla \cdot A)V - B(\nabla \cdot A) = 0,$$

$$\partial_A \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow -\nabla(|V|^2/2) + \partial_t B + \nabla(B \cdot V) = 0.$$

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3/4)

We use (2) $\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ to rewrite $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$ as:

$$\mathcal{I}_2(A, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} dx dt.$$

Claim: whenever (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, then (A, V) is also critical for $\mathcal{I}_2(A, V)$, but subject to (2).

Proof: Let us introduce Lagrangian $\mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = \mathcal{I}_2(A, V) - \int B \cdot (\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A))$.

The corresponding optimality equations read:

$$\partial_B \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow (2) \text{ (of course)}, \quad \partial_V \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow (\nabla \cdot A)V - B(\nabla \cdot A) = 0,$$

$$\partial_A \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow -\nabla(|V|^2/2) + \partial_t B + \nabla(B \cdot V) = 0.$$

Assuming that (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, we have

$$\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0 \text{ and } \partial_t V + \nabla(|V|^2/2) = 0.$$

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3/4)

We use (2) $\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ to rewrite $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$ as:

$$\mathcal{I}_2(A, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot A) |V|^2}{2} dx dt.$$

Claim: whenever (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, then (A, V) is also critical for $\mathcal{I}_2(A, V)$, but subject to (2).

Proof: Let us introduce Lagrangian $\mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = \mathcal{I}_2(A, V) - \int B \cdot (\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A))$.

The corresponding optimality equations read:

$$\partial_B \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow (2) \text{ (of course)}, \quad \partial_V \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow (\nabla \cdot A)V - B(\nabla \cdot A) = 0,$$

$$\partial_A \mathcal{L}(A, V, B) = 0 \Rightarrow -\nabla(|V|^2/2) + \partial_t B + \nabla(B \cdot V) = 0.$$

Assuming that (A, V) is critical for $\mathcal{I}(A, V)$, we have

$\partial_t A + V(\nabla \cdot A) = 0$ and $\partial_t V + \nabla(|V|^2/2) = 0$. Setting $B = V$, we are just in business!

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (4/4)

Let us now write everything in terms of $(\rho = \nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}, V)$:

$$(2) \quad \partial_t \mathbf{A} + V(\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}) = 0 \Rightarrow \partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho \mathbf{V}) = 0,$$

$$\mathcal{I}_2(\mathbf{A}, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A})|V|^2}{2} dxdt \Rightarrow \int \frac{\rho|V|^2}{2} dxdt.$$

A toy model : the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (4/4)

Let us now write everything in terms of $(\rho = \nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}, V)$:

$$(2) \quad \partial_t \mathbf{A} + V(\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A}) = 0 \Rightarrow \partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho \mathbf{V}) = 0,$$

$$\mathcal{I}_2(\mathbf{A}, V) = \int \frac{(\nabla \cdot \mathbf{A})|V|^2}{2} dxdt \Rightarrow \int \frac{\rho|V|^2}{2} dxdt.$$

So, we just find the usual quadratic optimal problem in its BB formulation (up to BC which are ignored here)!

BB formulation of General Relativity in vacuum

We now treat the zero-Ricci 'phase-space' equation

$$\partial_{x^k} V_j^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^j) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^j - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_j^\gamma V_\gamma^j) = 0$$

just as the HJ equation with the following dictionary

BB formulation of General Relativity in vacuum

We now treat the zero-Ricci 'phase-space' equation

$$\partial_{x^k} V_j^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^j) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^j - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_j^\gamma V_\gamma^j) = 0$$

just as the HJ equation with the following dictionary

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) \quad \Leftarrow \quad \rho(t, x)$$

BB formulation of General Relativity in vacuum

We now treat the zero-Ricci 'phase-space' equation

$$\partial_{x^k} V_j^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^j) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^j - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_j^\gamma V_\gamma^j) = 0$$

just as the HJ equation with the following dictionary

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) \quad \Leftarrow \quad \rho(t, x)$$

$$\partial_{x^j} C_k^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (C V + V C)_k^j = 0 \quad \Leftarrow \quad \partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho V) = 0,$$

BB formulation of General Relativity in vacuum

We now treat the zero-Ricci 'phase-space' equation

$$\partial_{x^k} V_j^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^j) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^j - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_j^\gamma V_\gamma^j) = 0$$

just as the HJ equation with the following dictionary

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) \quad \Leftarrow \quad \rho(t, x)$$

$$\partial_{x^j} C_k^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (C V + V C)_k^j = 0 \quad \Leftarrow \quad \partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho V) = 0,$$

$$\int \text{trace}(C(x, \xi) V^2(x, \xi)) dx d\xi \quad \Leftarrow \quad \int \rho |V|^2 dx dt$$

BB formulation of General Relativity in vacuum

We now treat the zero-Ricci 'phase-space' equation

$$\partial_{x^k} V_j^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (V_k^\gamma V_\gamma^j) - \partial_{x^j} V_k^j - \partial_{\xi^k} (V_j^\gamma V_\gamma^j) = 0$$

just as the HJ equation with the following dictionary

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) \quad \Leftarrow \quad \rho(t, x)$$

$$\partial_{x^j} C_k^j + \partial_{\xi^j} (C V + V C)_k^j = 0 \quad \Leftarrow \quad \partial_t \rho + \nabla \cdot (\rho V) = 0,$$

$$\int \text{trace}(C(x, \xi) V^2(x, \xi)) dx d\xi \quad \Leftarrow \quad \int \rho |V|^2 dx dt$$

and subject to $\partial_{\xi^i} V_j^k = \partial_{\xi^j} V_i^k, \quad \partial_{\xi^m} C_\gamma^\gamma \delta_k^j - 3\partial_{\xi^m} C_k^j = \partial_{\xi^k} C_\gamma^\gamma \delta_m^j - 3\partial_{\xi^k} C_m^j.$

Finally, we check that, whenever (g, Γ) is a smooth solution to the Einstein equations in vacuum, then

$$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x) \xi^\gamma,$$

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) = \partial_{\xi^k} A^j(x, \xi) - \partial_{\xi^q} A^q(x, \xi) \delta_k^j,$$

$$A^j(x, \xi) = \xi^j \det g(x) \cos\left(\frac{g_{\alpha\beta}(x) \xi^\alpha \xi^\beta}{2}\right).$$

defines a solution (C, V) to the BB-OT formulation.

ref: <https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-03311171>

Finally, we check that, whenever (g, Γ) is a smooth solution to the Einstein equations in vacuum, then

$$V_k^j(x, \xi) = -\Gamma_{k\gamma}^j(x) \xi^\gamma,$$

$$C_k^j(x, \xi) = \partial_{\xi^k} A^j(x, \xi) - \partial_{\xi^q} A^q(x, \xi) \delta_k^j,$$

$$A^j(x, \xi) = \xi^j \det g(x) \cos\left(\frac{g_{\alpha\beta}(x) \xi^\alpha \xi^\beta}{2}\right).$$

defines a solution (C, V) to the BB-OT formulation.

ref: <https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-03311171>

END OF PROOF!

THANKS FOR YOUR ATTENTION!

THANKS FOR YOUR ATTENTION!

**Thanks to Bernard Julia
and François-Xavier Vialart for their help!**